Relatório sobre participação em reunião do MAG e no WSIS Forum
Prof. Flávio Rech Wagner
Período: 12 a 16/06/2017
Local: Genebra, Suíça

1. Reunião do MAG

O MAG (Multistakeholder Advisory Group) é o grupo de trabalho multissetorial indicado pela ONU (Organização das Nações Unidas) para preparar a programação do IGF (Fórum de Governança da Internet), evento realizado anualmente desde 2006 e criado no contexto da Cúpula Mundial da Sociedade da Informação. Estou em meu terceiro ano como membro do MAG, tendo meu nome sido indicado pelo CGI.br. O IGF deste ano será realizado em Genebra, entre os dias 18 e 21 de dezembro.

O MAG reuniu-se presencialmente em Genebra, entre os dias 12 e 14 de junho de 2017, para cumprir a agenda que é mostrada no Anexo 1 deste relatório. Além de um dia inicial dedicado a consultas à comunidade a respeito dos principais assuntos sob responsabilidade do MAG, além de relatos sobre diversas atividades no contexto do IGF (especialmente Fóruns de Melhores Práticas, Coalizões Dinâmicas e IGFs Nacionais e Regionais), a reunião teve como pontos principais a seleção dos workshops a serem realizados durante o IGF em dezembro e a decisão a respeito das sessões plenárias a serem organizadas pelo próprio MAG.

Foram submetidos ao IGF deste ano 268 propostas de workshops, vindas de múltiplas entidades dos diferentes setores e de múltiplas regiões do mundo. Durante o mês de maio, os membros do MAG fizeram uma avaliação online das propostas submetidas. Na reunião presencial em Genebra, entre os dias 12 e 14 de junho, o MAG tomou a decisão final em relação à seleção dos workshops a serem realizados, tendo por base a avaliação online de cada um deles mas também procurando selecionar um conjunto de workshops que apresente uma adequada diversidade de temas e de proponentes (distribuídos pelas regiões geográficas e pelos diversos setores). Prioridade foi dada a propostas vindas de países subdesenvolvidos ou emergentes e vindas de entidades que ainda não haviam organizado workshops em edições anteriores do IGF.

Ao final dos três dias de trabalho, o MAG chegou a um resultado que é mostrado no link a seguir:

https://www.intgovforum.org/multilingual/content/igf-2017-workshop-selection-results

Esta relação inclui 78 workshops aceitos definitivamente, 24 workshops aceitos condicionalmente (os proponentes precisarão fazer ajustes segundo condições estabelecidas pelo MAG) e 2 workshops colocados em lista de espera (serão aceitos caso haja disponibilidade na programação).

O CGI.br e o NIC.br, como em anos anteriores, foram muito bem sucedidos no processo de seleção. De sete propostas por eles submetidas, quatro foram aprovadas, conforme tabela abaixo, que também mostra a classificação de cada uma delas no ranking elaborado após a avaliação online feita pelos membros do MAG (cada proposta recebeu notas de 1 a 5, segundo diferentes critérios de avaliação). Destaque para duas propostas do CGI (uma delas tendo o NUPEF como parceiro) que alcançaram o primeiro e o quarto lugares no ranking geral. Esse destaque demonstra cabalmente a

grande qualidade técnica da assessoria do CGI, que propôs e detalhou esses workshops, e seu conhecimento e domínio dos temas atuais de Governança da Internet.

Propostas com o CGI.br como organizador principal

Assessing implications of Internet Shutdowns according to Internet Governance Principles	1º lugar, nota média 4,71
Emerging challenges for data protection in Latin American countries	61º lugar, nota média 4,08

Proposta liderada pelo NUPEF, CGI.br como co-organizador

State-led interference in encrypted systems: a public debate on different policy approaches	4º lugar, nota média 4,50

Proposta submetida pelo NIC.br, nas quais o CGI.br aparece como co-organizador

Virtual Reality is the next computing platform for development: challenges and opportunities	56º lugar, nota média 4,13

O MAG também dedicou um tempo considerável à apreciação de propostas de sessões plenárias principais. Além de sessões de abertura e de encerramento oficiais, o IGF também inclui outras sessões principais, uma no turno da manhã e outra no turno da tarde de cada dia do evento. Tais sessões são propostas e organizadas pelos próprios membros do MAG, que procuram escolher temas de grande abrangência, atualidade e interesse de todos os participantes do evento.

A reunião não chegou a uma decisão final sobre o conjunto completo de sessões principais a serem realizadas, o que precisará ocorrer em uma próxima reunião virtual do MAG. Foi aprovada uma sessão proposta pelo governo suíço, anfitrião do evento, intitulada "The impact of digitization on politics, public trust and democracy". Também foram aprovadas duas sessões plenárias que serão organizadas pelos IGFs nacionais e regionais (que terá como tema "Digital Rights") e pelas Coalizões Dinâmicas. Outras seis propostas, mostradas na tabela abaixo, ainda estão em discussão, devendo serem aprovadas apenas três ou quatro delas. Eventualmente, algumas delas poderão ser agrupadas, em função de possíveis afinidades ou superposições temáticas.

Propostas de sessões principais ainda em discussão

'Gender inclusion and the future of the internet'
'Creating an Inclusive Workforce in the Digital Economy'
'Human and Social Dimensions of the Internet'
'Empowering Global Cooperation on Cybersecurity for Sustainable Development & Peace'
'Data for Sustainable Development Road-Maps'
'Local Interventions, Global Impacts: How Can International, Multistakeholder Cooperation Address Internet Shutdowns, Encryption and Data Flows'

A última proposta listada na tabela acima foi proposta por mim, em parceria com Virginia Paque, também membro do MAG e representante da Diplo Foundation, resultando da fusão de duas

propostas originalmente submetidas de forma independente. Essa proposta está detalhada no Anexo 2 desse relatório. Para sua elaboração foi essencial o trabalho altamente qualificado da assessoria do CGI.br. Como a proposta recebeu muitos apoios no MAG, e já representa a fusão de duas propostas anteriores, acredito que ela tem grandes chances de aprovação. Assim, pelo terceiro ano consecutivo, o CGI.br terá papel de protagonismo nas sessões principais do IGF. Em 2015 e 2016 o CGI.br foi o proponente e co-organizador das sessões principais "NETmundial and the evolution of the Internet Governance ecosystem" e "Shaping the Future of Internet Governance", respectivamente.

2. WSIS Forum

A reunião do MAG realizou-se em paralelo com o WSIS Forum, evento realizado anualmente sob organização da UIT – União Internacional de Telecomunicações e que discute o progresso das linhas de ação estabelecidas pela Cúpula Mundial da Sociedade da Informação (WSIS, na sigla em inglês). O WSIS Forum transcorreu no período de 12 a 16 de junho, na própria sede da UIT. O site web do evento está em https://www.itu.int/net4/wsis/forum/2017/.

Em função de minha participação na reunião do MAG entre os dias 12 e 14, só pude participar dos dois últimos dias do WSIS Forum. As tabelas abaixo indicam as sessões que pude acompanhar nesses dois dias.

Quinta-feira

Capacity Building Programmes at ICANN and Elsewhere (ICANN CCWG on Internet Governance)
Context of Big Data and Analytics for Knowledge Societies (UNESCO)
IGF Information Session (IGF Secretariat)
Strengthening privacy, encryption and source protection for media freedom and Internet development (UNESCO)
Action Line C2. Information and Communication Infrastructure: Building the Foundation for an Inclusive Information Society (ITU)

Sexta-feira

Implementing Collaborative Security: Challenges and Success Stories (ISOC)
Future and emerging technologies - Quantum computing (ITU)
WSIS Action Line Facilitators Meeting (ITU)
Closing Ceremony

Em particular, atuei como painelista na sessão "Implementing Collaborative Security: Challenges and Success Stories", promovida pela ISOC. Relatei em detalhes o papel de liderança do CGI.br e do NIC.br, através do CERT.br, no trabalho colaborativo realizado para gerência da porta 25 e redução do spam propagado pela infecção de redes e máquinas sediadas no Brasil, em parceria com diversas outras instituições, como operadoras de telecomunicações, provedores de acesso, associações dos setores interessados, Anatel, Ministério Público Federal, órgãos de defesa do consumidor e Ministério da Justiça. Também citei brevemente outros esforços cooperativos do CERT.br, como os projetos HoneyPots e SpamPots e os CSIRTs interinstitucionais criados para monitoramento e prevenção de incidentes durante a Copa do Mundo de 2014 e os Jogos Olímpicos de 2016. O painel também discutiu desafios e oportunidades para a implementação colaborativa de

medidas de segurança, tendo eu enfatizado a necessidade de adoção do modelo multissetorial de governança, com o envolvimento de todos os setores afetados e interessados.

ANEXO 1. Agenda 2nd Open Consultations and MAG Meeting

Day 1: 12 June 2017 - Open Consultations

Time	Agenda Item
10:00 - 10:40	1. Welcome from MAG Chair and adoption of the agenda 2. Welcome from Honorary Host Country Chair and briefing on state of preparations for annual meeting by Host Country
10:40 - 11:10	3. Briefing on state of preparations from IGF Secretariat and Host Country a) Workshop proposals b) Open Forums, Day-Zero, IGF Village c) Main/Thematic Sessions (Overview from MAG WG on Main Sessions) 4. Updates from IGF Best Practice Forums (BPFs) (list them) and
11:10 - 11:50	5. IGF Policy Options for Connecting and Enabling the Next Billion(s) - Phase III
11:50 - 13:00	6. Updates from National and Regional IGF Initiatives (NRIs)
13:00 - 15:00	Lunch
15:00 - 16:00	7. Updates from IGF Dynamic Coalitions (DCs) 8. Updates on MAG working Groups
16:00 - 17:15	9. Briefings from other related/relevant initiatives or organizations
17:15 - 18:00	10. Open Discussion w/community on ways to encourage Governments and Private Sector participation

ANEXO 1. Agenda 2nd Open Consultations and MAG Meeting

Day 2: 13 June 2017 - MAG Meeting (open to observers)

Time	Agenda Item
10:00 - 10:30	1. Opening Statements a) Introduction from the Chair and adoption of agenda
10:30-13:00 (continued below)	2. Overview of workshop proposal evaluations, a) Review final workshop selection process b) Workshop selection
13:00 - 15:00	Lunch
15:00 - 18:00 (continued below)	3. Continue workshop selection

Day 3: 14 June 2017 - MAG Meeting (open to observers)

Time	Agenda Item
10:00 - 11:30	1. Continue and finalize workshop selection
11:30 - 13:00 (continued below)	2. Discussion on Main/Focus Sessions a) Update from MAG WG on Main/Focus Sessions b) Main/Focus Sessions: Content including desired outcomes/outputs, format, length, etc. c) Selection and scheduling of main/focus sessions d) Next steps in planning, appointment of MAG lead facilitators
13:00 - 15:00	Lunch

15:00 - 17:00	3. Follow-up as needed based on status updates from Open Consultations. -Working Groups - BPFs - CENB Phase III - NRIs - DCs
17:00 - 17:45	4) Next steps in annual meeting programming, main session planning, etc.
17:45 - 18:00	5) Any Other Business

ANEXO 2. PROPOSTA DE SESSÃO PRINCIPAL COM PARTICIPAÇÃO DO CGI.br

1.   Title of the Session

Local interventions, global impacts: How can international, multistakeholder cooperation address Internet shutdowns, encryption and data flows

2.   Length: 3 hours.

3.   Brief Description/Objective

The Internet has had a remarkable impact on the empowerment of individuals, transforming industries and economies, and bringing new ideas to governments. This has created growth, innovation and competition for the benefit of individual users, communities and economies worldwide. Human security and well-being increasingly depend on ICT-based health, transportation, and other systems. The data economy and, in particular, disruptive business models heavily rely on data. International cooperation for development also relies on data to increase the effectiveness and the capacity for the achievement of the sustainable development goals (SDGs).

At the same time, the rapid growth and pace of innovation both of new technologies and also convergence with existing ones have sometimes outpaced traditional regulatory models and may prompt unilateral local actions that threaten the open, stable and interconnected nature of the Internet. Multistakeholder dialogue can help find the least intrusive methods of safeguarding recognized local interest, while maintaining a safe, secure and resilient global network that fosters social-economic development and innovation.

Since the IGF was created, discussion regarding Internet regulation has matured and spread all over the Internet governance ecosystem, becoming a permanent topic on the agendas of several Internet governance arenas, as well as in traditional spaces such as the health sector (data protection), national defence (cybersecurity) and trade. Some topics that have drawn the attention of national governments and intergovernmental organizations as instances where regulation might be needed include cybersecurity (especially terrorism and surveillance), cybercrime, data flows (especially international data transfers, data retention, and data localization), content regulation (especially with regard to extremist content, child safety and intellectual property rights), among several others. While national regulation proliferates, the enforcement of these rules is not simple since the Internet creates a transnational environment that does not easily conform to traditional jurisdictional boundaries. In this sense, any local action might have global (sometimes unintended) consequences.

This main session aims at discussing the impacts that some policy initiatives may have on the global Internet environment as well as the jurisdictional issues that are still to be solved on that behalf. It will gather experts from different countries and stakeholder groups to discuss three different but interrelated topics: Internet shutdowns, encryption and data flows. While there is widespread awareness about human rights' related aspects of those issues, there is little discussion about the

aggregate effects that they might have to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SGDs). For instance how do Internet shutdowns that affect Internet users in general impact the activities of international cooperation agencies and countries which benefit from them? Shutdowns affect the SDGs as they lower the overall economic and social well-being of the population, setting back progress towards the SDGs instead of advancing them.

Besides having been central aspects of the Internet governance agenda in the last decade, Internet shutdowns, encryption and data flows are the topics of discussion in a number of workshop proposals received for the 2017 IGF. Hence, the session provides an opportunity for those workshops to feed into the debate and aims at creating a common and unified space for the discussion of those issues in a coordinated manner.

Considering that the IGF 2017 will be held in Geneva, home to many specialized global organizations whose activities have a significant impact on citizens and nations worldwide, this session also aims at involving intergovernmental organizations that can feed into the debate and share their experiences in implementing cooperative efforts towards the solution of problems regarding Internet shutdowns, encryption and data flows and other related fields, as well as in diplomatic negotiations regarding, for instance, privacy, security, digital trade and other important issues.

Conclusions and recommendations developed throughout the session, and articulated in the final segment, should set the stage for moving forward with concrete networking actions during the rest of the IGF meeting, and into the future.

4.   Agenda

This session is suggested to serve as a focal point for coordinated and constructive discussions about the three different but interrelated aspects of Internet governance as described above. The session will benefit from the inclusion of all stakeholder groups, who shall be able to provide key insight on the global cooperation that is necessary for the Internet to improve human rights, peace, and well-being. The outline chosen to serve that purpose comprises both a gathering of specialists to kick-start the conversation as well as a traditional open mic space to increase the number of viewpoints on the matters under discussion. The session is structured around three main 50-minute segments, each one organized around specific policy questions that examine the respective topic, plus a concluding 10-minute segment:

- Session introduction [10 min]
- Segment 1 [50 min]: Internet shutdowns
- Segment 2 [50 min]: Encryption
- Segment 3 [50 min]: Data flows
- Conclusion [10 min]: Multistakeholder cooperation for effective progress
- Session wrap-up [10 min]

The session introduction will include host country remarks and an explanation of the flow of the session by the moderator.

All three initial segments follow the same internal structure: (a) an invited specialist provides a preliminary response to the policy question(s) at hand (5 min); (b) a multistakeholder and geographically diverse round-table puts together a group of individuals who are tasked with reacting to the expert's intervention and presenting the situation of specific regions and communities to help shaping the issue to the audience (25 min); and (c) an open mic session follows to enable the audience and remote participants to join the conversation and present their experiences, opinions, suggestions, etc., on how to move the debate forward (20 min).

After the third round, a final segment will feature a discussant who will delve into how international organisations can play a prominent role in cooperative efforts and how multistakeholder dialogue can leverage that role towards the solution of major problems along the three lines discussed in the previous segments.

This format allows the session to host 21 individual interventions (6 per each of the three initial segments/round-tables, 1 keynote speaker for the conclusion on multistakeholder cooperation and 2 for the introduction and conclusion of the session). This number is enough to accommodate individuals from all five regions and all stakeholder groups, with a view of having a 50/50 gender ratio among the invitees. It is also enough to gather individuals who have convergent and divergent economic, political and social perspectives on the policy questions suggested above. To broaden participation, online interaction will rely on the WebEx platform. Social media (Twitter and Facebook) will also be employed by the on-line moderators who will be in charge of browsing social media using some hashtags (to be defined).

5. Policy Questions

- **Segment 1: Internet shutdowns.** How has the debate around Internet shutdowns evolved in the past years? What are the new motivations for shutdowns and how do they impact on the global infrastructure of the Internet? How do they affect specific countries, organisations (both global and international), and communities? How do Internet shutdowns that affect Internet users in general impact the activities of international cooperation agencies and countries who benefit from them? How can international cooperation help solve the issues of "local interventions, global impact" regarding internet shutdowns?

- **Segment 2: Encryption.** How has the debate around encryption evolved in the past years? Does encryption pose a threat to public and national security? What are the impacts of local state-led interference with cryptographic systems to the security, stability and resiliency of the global Internet? What are the impacts of those local measures for the transnational activities of cooperation and humanitarian agencies, and the network of actors who carry out those activities? How can international cooperation help solve the issues of "local interventions, global impact" regarding encryption?

- **Segment 3: Data flows.** How has data been used in different countries and/or by intergovernmental organizations? What is the state of the art regarding data retention and data localization measures? Do data localization rules endanger the Internet as an unfragmented space? Is there an inherent conflict between the collection/use of data as a tool for development and humanitarian projects and the protection of privacy? How can

international cooperation help solve the issues of "local interventions, global impact" regarding data flows?

- ***Conclusions and recommendations – Connecting the dots: multistakeholder, global, and international co-operation:*** Regarding issues of Internet shutdowns, encryption and data flows, **h**ow can international organisations adapt to the ever-changing data policy environment while working on improving human rights, peace, and well-being? How can their efforts for capacity development improve strategies, planning, outreach, and effectiveness in these areas?

6. Chair [To be provided by the Host Country]

To be defined

7. Moderators

To be defined

8. Panelists

- Technical Community: TBD
- Civil Society: TBD
- Private Sector: TBD
- Government: TBD
- Intergovernmental Organizations: TBD

9. Remote moderator / Plan for online interaction

To broaden participation, online interaction will rely on the WebEx platform. Social media (Twitter and Facebook) will also be employed by the on-line moderators who will be in charge of browsing social media using some hashtags (to be defined). We will try to have English, French, Portuguese, and Spanish online moderators, and a systematic queue.

10. 'Feeder' workshops (if applicable) and/or connections with other sessions

Representatives of other related IGF threads may be invited as speakers in the main session or may be invited to summarize contributions of those threads from the audience. This would provide a smooth and tighter integration of the outcomes of those threads into the IGF 2017 mainstream debates. Examples of such activities are given below:

- ***Workshops:*** (see attached file with list of workshops submitted to the IGF 2017)
- ***Dynamic Coalitions:*** Child Online Safety; Core Internet Values; Freedom of Expression and Freedom of the Media on the Internet; Internet Rights and Principles; Platform Responsibility.
- ***BPFs***: Cybersecurity, Gender and Access.

11. Desired results/output

- An overarching map of regional policy initiatives that impact the global Internet environment in relation to Internet shutdowns, encryption and data flows;
- Documentation of expert knowledge from panelists of different countries and stakeholder groups in relation to the areas under discussion;
- Multistakeholder dialogue on the impacts that some policy initiatives may have on the global Internet environment as well as the jurisdictional issues that are still to be solved on that behalf;
- Recommendations and conclusions which show the way forward to outreach and networking to develop ideas generated during this session;
- Summary of the debates and the creation of a common and unified space for the discussion of those issues in a coordinated manner through intersessional activities carried out by the IGF community.